



Follow-up to 2002 Gender Assessment of EEPP

May 2003

Submitted by the
Monitoring, Verification, and Evaluation (MVE) Unit
to:
The Egyptian Environmental Policy Program
Executive Committee
and
USAID/Egypt

USAID Contract No. LAG-I-00-99-00014-00, TO 811

Implemented by **CHEMONICS INTERNATIONAL, INC.**,

with Subcontractors **CHEMONICS EGYPT** and **ENVIRONICS**

Table of Contents

List of Acronyms	iii
1. Introduction	1
USAID and Egyptian Environmental Issues	1
Gender Issues	2
Bilateral Agreement for EEPP.....	2
USAID Commitment to Gender Issues.....	2
Government of Egypt Commitment to Gender Issues.....	3
Available Information on Gender Issues in Egypt.....	5
2. EEPP and Gender Issues: Clones Report	6
Program-wide	6
Projects	8
4. Assessment and Conclusions	9
Obstacles to Implementing the Recommendations of the Clones study in General:.....	9
Study dissemination, review, and feedback:.....	9
Implementation of Study Recommendations:.....	9
Overall conclusions:	10
5. Recommendations	11
Program actions to be Implemented during the Remainder of EEPP Tranche 2	11
Actions in specific projects to be Implemented during the Remainder of EEPP Tranche 2.....	11
Recommendations for the Design and Implementation of the follow-on PEP Program	12

List of Acronyms

DSP	Development Support Program
EEAA	Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency
EEPP	Egyptian Environmental Policy Program
ENR	Environment and Natural Resources
GOE	Government of Egypt
LE	Egyptian pound (currency)
MSEA	Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs
MVE	Monitoring, Verification and Evaluation Project
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PEP	Partnership for Environmental Progress
RP	Request for Proposal
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WID	[USAID Office of] Women in Development

1. Introduction

In early 2002, USAID asked the Program Support Unit of the EEPP, the entity within the project with crosscutting responsibilities, to undertake a gender assessment of the program. Dr. Julia Clones, an economist and environment and gender specialist, carried out the study beginning May 2002. It provides expert baseline data, conclusions, and recommendations on which this paper is based.¹ This present MVE study updates the Clones study in light of another year of program operations.

USAID AND EGYPTIAN ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES

The United States Agency for International Development (USAID) has a long-standing interest in environmental issues in Egypt. In the 1980s and 90s, its undertakings were primarily centered on building and rehabilitating infrastructure and institutional development so that concerned utilities would operate in a more business-like manner, in line with the Government of Egypt's (GOE) efforts to loosen control of the economy.

At the same time, both the GOE and USAID were becoming aware that urban Cairo was suffering from ever-increasing pollution: noise pollution, uncollected solid waste, and air pollution. The GOE, responding to the situation throughout the country and to international concerns, founded the Ministry of State for the Environment (MSEA), reporting directly to the Prime Minister. In 1994, Egypt enacted an environmental law (Law No. 4 of Year 1994), and its Executive Regulations cover pollution, air and water quality, natural protectorates, hazardous materials, and a host of other areas.

Implementing the regulations of Law No. 4 is the work of the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA), which is attached to the ministry.

USAID and the GOE began to emphasize institutional support for the agencies and ministries that deal with environmental issues and laid plans for a large project to address air pollution (CAIP) and smaller projects to assist with protection of coral reefs, account for hazardous materials, and to continue building and improving institutional and technical infrastructure. (name these?)

The Egyptian Environmental Policy Program (EEPP) operates at a different level. This effort aims to address policy that affects Egypt's environment over the long term. The EEPP, which began in 1999, is comprised of seven discrete projects (technical assistance components) working in collaboration with GOE bodies concerned with management of various sub-sector areas and also a Monitoring, Verification, and Evaluation Unit (MVE) responsible for verifying and evaluating accomplishments.

GENDER ISSUES

USAID and other international donors first began discussing gender-related issues in the 1970s as it became clear that men and women have unequal access to and control over resources and that employing an explicit gender analysis could improve the effectiveness of development efforts). In 1974, USAID established an Office for Women in Development (WID). Today the WID office assists with integration of gender concerns into all USAID programs, coordinates with the donor community, and identifies emerging issues where gender is a key concern. The office has four strategic objectives:

1. Enhancing the economic status of women
2. Expanding educational opportunities for girls and women
3. Improving women's legal rights and increasing their participation in civil society
4. Integrating gender considerations throughout USAID programs

The WID provides technical assistance and training to identify and develop innovative approaches to the constraints faced by women in developing countries and works to advance the knowledge base on effective change strategies.

BILATERAL AGREEMENT FOR EEPP

The EEPP was agreed to following negotiations between the governments of the United States, acting through USAID, and the Arab Republic of Egypt, acting through the EEAA–MSEA, the Ministry of Petroleum’s Organization for Energy Planning, and the Ministry of Tourism’s Tourism Development Authority. In Tranche 2 the Egyptian Holding Company for Natural Gas joined the program. A Memorandum of Understanding was signed in 1999, whereby the GOE would seek to implement a set of environmental policy measures, using technical support and other assistance provided by USAID. EEPP is a multi-year activity to support policy, institutional, and regulatory reforms in the environmental sector, focusing on economic and institutional constraints, cleaner and more efficient energy use, reduced air pollution, improved solid waste management, sustainable Red Sea tourism, and natural resources managed for environmental sustainability.

USAID COMMITMENT TO GENDER ISSUES

In the past, USAID environmental projects “... had not been designed with a special focus on gender issues...”¹ However, when it became apparent that the treatment of considerations in such matters as gender-related divisions of labor in the economy were indeed important, program managers recruited support for project revisions to increase the percentages of female participants and trainers and to incorporate gender and family issues into instructional materials. USAID’s Office of WID writes, “Unless resource

¹ “Sustaining Economies and Ecosystems: Gender and Coastal Resource Management,” USAID’s Office of Women in Development, Information Bulletin, April 1998.

management programs are truly open to the women they serve, these programs might succeed in promoting conservation, but they cannot succeed in promoting sustainable development.”² As discussed earlier, USAID now has a clear commitment to integrating gender issues into its programs and projects. That commitment, however, does not always get formalized during the project design stage, as happened with the EEPP.

GOVERNMENT OF EGYPT COMMITMENT TO GENDER ISSUES

In 2000, Egypt established a National Council for Women, and in 2002 President Hosni Mubarak stated that gender mainstreaming would be one of the objectives for national environmental policy. Recently, all government agencies submitted new 5-year plans covering the period 1 July 2002–30 June 2007. These were to have been written specifically including gender in plan and budget proposals.

GOE’s Fifth 5-Year Plan for Socio-economic Development (2002–2007)

The Ministry of Planning cites five “aspects” in its national “Fifth 5-Year Plan for Socio-economic Development (2002–2007).” One of these is gender equity, explained as actions and measures that eliminate any discrimination against women, providing equal opportunities for both males and females. The Plan will address this issue through “Influencing society’s need for achievement by altering social attitudes and behaviors relating to the value of work, discipline, and commitment.”³

The Plan has two main components, one relating to public investment and the other to public policies to stimulate market forces to achieve economic objectives. The only strategy mentioned that addresses women’s issues is to increase women’s participation in the development process.⁴ Nearly all specific objectives and strategies are economic in nature. These, of course, do affect women, particularly those that deal with poverty alleviation, health care infrastructure, and education.

Investment in gender issues is covered under “Other Priorities,” which include research and development (LE20.7 billion), motherhood and child care (LE6.4 billion), gender (LE2.2 billion), and upgrading slum areas (LE1.5 billion).⁵

Gender issues are not integrated across sectors as the Plan discusses investment. However, in a separate section, it says:

The following are some policies that deal in particular with the gender issue:

- ♦ Developing and raising the percentage of women participating in different economic fields.

² Ibid.

³ Ministry of Planning, “The Fifth 5-Year Plan for Socio-economic Development (2002–2007).” [Translation from Arabic to English of a draft version of the Plan] Cairo, 2002.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Ibid.

- ◆ Providing training and rehabilitation programs for women and developing their capabilities in order to cope with the requirements of the labor market.
- ◆ Increasing the participation of women in setting developmental strategies.
- ◆ Achieving full absorption of rural girls of school age in basic education.
- ◆ Widening the dissemination of literacy programs for rural women who did not enroll in school.
- ◆ Providing opportunities for educating women not only through the official system but also through cultural, social, vocational and political organizations as well as work sites and training centers, in addition to developing the systems, programs and technologies of open education.
- ◆ Affirming the role of the media and [non-governmental organizations] NGOs in developing society's awareness of the role of women in development and the need for improving their educational and skill standards.
- ◆ Changing the prevailing cultural and intellectual atmosphere concerning women by reconsidering concepts that generate gender discrimination and raising women's political awareness.
- ◆ Redistribution of health services provided for women and increasing their efficiency together with focusing on deprived areas.
- ◆ Expanding health projects and family planning services as well as raising the efficiency of health units.
- ◆ Issuing legislation that guarantees the protection of women's and children's health.
- ◆ Expanding the establishment of social security networks and coverage.
- ◆ Raising awareness of gender issues, culture, and justice as well as gender equality for all workers in the different culture and information media.⁶

In the section on sectoral development, little attention is paid to gender issues.

EEAA's 5-Year Plan

The MSEA–EEAA's 5-year plan lists its most important goals for the plan period as:

1. Improving air quality
2. Protecting the Nile River from pollution
3. Nature conservation and protecting bio-diversity
4. Expanding tree plantation and increasing greenery
5. Promoting public environmental awareness within the community

⁶ Ibid.

6. Supporting capacity building of EEAA and Regional Branch Offices
7. Fulfilling Egypt's international obligations in the field of environment.⁷

The draft plan does not discuss gender issues.

AVAILABLE INFORMATION ON GENDER ISSUES IN EGYPT

Little baseline data is available for women's issues in Egypt/the Middle East. No research has been found concerning women and policy planning and the statistics that exist are typical international statistics from the UN or World Bank on literacy and maternal mortality. There are a few sites on the Internet—mostly western in origination—that deal with Egyptian women, although weighted heavily to women and Islam. The most comprehensive site with links to a number of studies is www.columbia.edu/cu/lweb/indiv/mideast/cuvm/women.html; however, even this one does not specifically address women in Egypt.

Gender and development, and gender and environment offer more information, although it is not regionally specific. WomenWatch is the United Nations Internet gateway on the advancement and empowerment of women. Its Internet address is <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/>, while Women-Enviro is an online working group to strengthen women's role in environmental sustainability. The group discusses:

- ♦ What has been done to increase women's role in environmental sustainability, and to ensure that gender concerns are integrated in policies and programs?
- ♦ What are the obstacles that remain and how are they being addressed?
- ♦ What must be done in the future?

Anyone interested in these issues is welcome to join in discussions. A typical post discusses the integration of gender concerns and perspectives in policies and programs for sustainable development. The address of this post is www.sdn.undp.org/ww/women-enviro/msg00133.html.

⁷ Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency, "Fifth 5-Year Plan (2002–2007). [Translation from Arabic to English of a draft version of the Plan] Cairo, 2002.

2. EEPP and Gender Issues: Clones Report

PROGRAM-WIDE

EEPP was designed, issued, and contracted with no specific gender sensitivity mentioned. Dr. Clones said in her report, “Such [gender] messages ... are not reflected in the articulation of main objectives under the Egyptian Environmental Policy Program (EEPP).”⁸

Dr. Clones assesses the overall gender picture of EEPP, saying:

1. *Gender issues have not been taken into formal account at any level of the EEPP.* There is no evidence of inclusion of gender concerns in (i) the articulation of objectives; (ii) the determination of work plans; (iii) the requesting of technical assistance; (iv) the specification of indicators for monitoring, verification, and evaluation of deliverables; and (v) the design of feedback mechanisms for adjustments in the program.
2. *The EEPP seems to reflect the lack of participation of citizen stakeholders in its design and formulation.* This may to some extent explain why the program design does not incorporate a gender element.
3. *Many of EEPP’s policy measures appear to have gender effects, but they are very difficult to evaluate because of the lack of baseline information.* In the different EEPP interventions, what is missing is “who” is impacted (men and/or women), and “how” they are affected.
4. Key actors in the EEPP do not necessarily have sufficient insight on how various policy measures affect different population groups. Gender expertise is also lacking at the level of technical assistance.⁹

Clones’ report—a final draft dated 7 August 2003—made a number of general and specific recommendations for actions that should be taken, some of which could be accomplished by the end of Tranche II (then expected to occur on 30 June 2003), and others that should be started during the remaining time of Tranche II and carried on by the anticipated follow-up program.

Clones noted however, that:

Assessing the gender dimension of EEPP is a complicated task on two accounts. On the one hand the complication is the wide scope of EEPP and the multiplicity and interdisciplinary nature of its objectives, which range from institutional reforms to operational interventions for aspects like solid waste management and Red Sea patrolling. On the other hand, the

⁸ Clones, p. 4.

⁹ Ibid, p. 4.

complication is the fact that the concept of “gender” is often confused with women’s isolated tasks or characteristics without reference to the intra-household and community relations between men and women.¹⁰

Clones’ specific recommendations for actions were:

Recommendations for actions to be accomplished by the end of Tranche II, without serious financial or managerial strain:

1. Initiate right away, *brainstorming sessions* with key actors of the EEPP to identify gender issues in their respective lines of work. Start with a roundtable of all key actors in GOE and the technical support groups of the EEPP. Have USAID assist by disseminating its gender experiences from other countries, such as success stories on integrating gender in environmental policies and practices. Next concentrate on each technical assistance contractor separately. Concurrently, ask each of the various committees under EEPP’s partnerships to brainstorm the gender issues associated with their specific themes and areas of concern.
2. Initiate a small *short-term feasibility study by MVE* to determine what is feasible and sensible in addressing gender in the remaining time of Tranche II.
3. *Expand the scope of planned workshops* and other training by the various technical assistance teams, under all the EEPP objectives, to include skills on gender awareness raising and gender mainstreaming.
4. Prepare a *gender information package* and have it distributed to all key actors in EEPP, with the request to discuss it in staff meetings. The National Council for Women, the gender advisors in the various government agencies, and USAID’s gender advisor can be requested to collaborate in preparing such a package.
5. Establish a *gender unit in the Program Support Unit* to offer general technical support on gender. Several officials and other experts involved in the EEPP have suggested this. The rational (*sic*) and significance are obvious, but we could not assess the feasibility of doing this within the time and budget constraints of Tranche II.

Recommendations for actions with a longer horizon, but which should start during Tranche II:

1. Implement an information and training program on how to identify and incorporate gender issues for all key actors in the implementation of the EEPP. Collaboration with the National Council for Women, GOE gender advisors, USAID Gender Advisor, and NGO Service Center should be sought.
2. Concurrently with training on gender awareness and mainstreaming, establish staff incentives and accountability mechanisms in the components of EEPP to encourage them to incorporate a gender approach.
3. Within EEPP, develop an effective gender-sensitive process for consultations with representatives of society, particularly women, in order to increase the effectiveness

¹⁰ Ibid, p. 6.

of the program's interventions the environmental awareness of all members of the society.¹¹

PROJECTS

Dr. Clones provided specific recommendations for each EEPP policy objective beginning on page 25 of her report.

¹¹ Ibid, p. 5.

4. Assessment and Conclusions

OBSTACLES TO IMPLEMENTING THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE CLONES STUDY IN GENERAL:

Timing:

The timing of the study was, perhaps, unfortunate, in that it was done after nearly three years of work in some areas and when, as far as was generally known, the program had only a year to run. Project staff had long since formed strategic partnerships with agencies and organizations and established working relationships. Focus by this time was on implementation of milestones and benchmarks that had been agreed after the beginning of Tranche II.

Another complicating factor was that, for a number of projects, contracts were in the process of being extended, renewed, and completely rewritten. Gender issues were not formalized or funded in these new contracts; in fact, overall funding was decreased in many cases making it difficult to fund “new” or “additional” issues. New work plans for project extensions did not include language that addressed gender issues.

STUDY DISSEMINATION, REVIEW, AND FEEDBACK:

It is uncertain if the final version of the report was even distributed. MVE worked from the “final draft” version. Subsequently, to the available knowledge, the study has not been disseminated and reviewed by relevant parties, which may imply that no discussion of its provisions took place or feedback was generated.

IMPLEMENTATION OF STUDY RECOMMENDATIONS:

Reports documenting EEPP process and progress do not indicate that any of the general recommendations have been implemented.

Similarly, regarding specific recommendations, reports from individual projects do not indicate that any specific recommendations have been put into practice. However, there is yet time to implement some of them within projects that will extend beyond June 2003. Beyond those of the original Clones report MVE makes a number of recommendations in the following section, especially for activities that were not in progress at the time of the Clones report, one year ago.

OVERALL CONCLUSIONS:

Dr. Clones wrote that:

- ♦ The overall conclusions from this assignment are that gender issues have not been taken into account so far in the formulation and implementation of the EEPP, and that a number of corrective actions can be initiated, even within the remaining period of Tranche II.
- ♦ Attention is particularly drawn to the need for possible adjustments in some work plans, even at this late stage, in order to incorporate gender. Short of modifying the work plans, several other recommendations are made here that could make a positive difference for alerting EEPP to gender concerns. This would give renewed opportunity to the National Council for Women and the gender advisors in EEPP's counterpart agencies to have a voice with their technical divisions.¹²

MVE agrees with her assessment, and concludes that basically none of the actions recommended by Dr. Clones in her mid-2002 report have been taken, based on reporting from the EEPP projects.

¹² Ibid, p. 17.

5. Recommendations

At the time of this review of Dr. Clones' assessment one year later, it seems clear that the recommendations made are still valid and should be implemented. In addition, it is recommended that additional specific actions be taken, as discussed below.

PROGRAM ACTIONS TO BE IMPLEMENTED DURING THE REMAINDER OF EEPP TRANCHE 2

Little time remains for many elements of the EEPP; however, some projects and activities are expected to be extended for as much as 12 more months through 2004. This provides the opportunity for some actions to be taken:

- ♦ Ensure immediate dissemination of Dr. Julia Clones' report, "Gender Assessment of the Egyptian Environmental Policy Program: Preliminary Findings and Recommendations," along with this further brief follow-up report, including request for comments and feedback.
- ♦ The USAID–Egypt Mission should hold a gender sensitivity training session for key staff from EEPP projects that will be continuing beyond June 2003, and require that these projects disseminate these lessons to their staff and key GOE partners.
- ♦ As USAID writes new contracts for project continuation, formalize and fund gender sensitivity within the EEPP, perhaps by inclusion of funding for a staff gender specialist with program-wide responsibility
- ♦ Require that contractors include accountability for gender issues in staff performance reviews
- ♦ Carry out the "brainstorming sessions" Clones referred to and do this at the level of the Agency Task Forces (ATF) and Working Groups.
- ♦ Require that all projects incorporate gender issues into work plans and goals for the extension period, particularly for public awareness activities and surveys, planning for development of eco-tourism in the Red Sea, and in the plan for verification and evaluation.

ACTIONS IN SPECIFIC PROJECTS TO BE IMPLEMENTED DURING THE REMAINDER OF EEPP TRANCHE 2

Dr. Clones included extensive guidelines for how to implement specific actions that would imbed gender sensitivity within EEPP. See Annex C of her report. Additionally, MVE suggests that some specific actions in ongoing projects could be implemented. Actual inclusion of these or others in the work plans of activities are a matter to be decided between the Participating Agencies, USAID, and the TA contractors.

- ♦ Objective 1: The dissemination of air quality information should be carried out in a manner that takes into accounts the different needs and media of women. Presumably the Comparative Health Risk Assessment being carried out will be gender sensitive.
- ♦ Objective 2: The gender impact of the declaration of the protected area in the southern Red Sea, if any, should be made clear. Does this affect local populations? Does it affect the women in the local populations? Also, when doing the consultations for the Southern Zone Conservation Management Plan and designing the Plan itself gender aspects should be clarified.
- ♦ Objective 3: The EPF should incorporate gender aspects into the design, funding review, and reporting. Possible funded projects should be reviewed not only for their economic effects but also for the gender effects.
- ♦ Objective 4: Along with the general effect of privatization on the existing solid waste private sector, the specific effects on women should be clarified. The movement of sorting operations from home- or village-based operations to industrial-style employment could have very large effects on female participation. The governorate monitoring units now being set up should also explicitly look at gender aspects of the private companies' operations.
- ♦ Objective 5: Review the guidelines that have been produced for hazardous waste handling for gender aspects.
- ♦ Objective 6: This could still be incorporated in the annual strategic plans that EEAA is making. It should also be part of the quality control checklist for the plans of each department.
- ♦ Objective 7: The effects of ecotourism and the participation of women in employment in this sector should be elucidated.
- ♦ Objective 9: Gender aspects and effects of economic instruments and best practices should be clarified.
- ♦ MVE: In its own work, MVE proposes to continue to seek gender breakdowns of indicators in the Monitoring System. It offers to work with projects in developing gender-relevant information and indicators for the above recommendations. And it proposes to conduct a final assessment of gender in EEPP in the summer of 2004 after virtually all project activities have been completed. Finally, at that time also, the "shape" of PEP will be known and MVE may make preliminary comments on gender inclusion in the PEP design.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FOLLOW-ON PEP PROGRAM

In discussing the EEPP, USAID says:

Phase two will focus on intensified implementation of selected and more complex private sector policy reforms, employment of larger-scale economic incentives, and continued emphasis on technology transfer, public

participation, and citizen awareness through a proposed new [Request for Proposals] RP entitled Partnership for Environmental Progress (PEP). PEP will rely on access to limited cash transfer resources from the Development Support Program or DSP program to complement technical assistance mechanisms. Envisioned activities include strengthening the private sector's capacity to respond to market forces, internalizing and remediating the costs of [environment and natural resources] ENR pollution and degradation, and encouraging further public sector decentralization.¹³

Gender issues are still not yet being addressed.

In order for greater gender sensitivity to be built into the PEP follow-on to EEPP, the gender dimension should be formalized in the program's design; it should be included in project scopes of work, and it should be funded at appropriate levels. Recommended actions include:

- ♦ Incorporating review of this and Dr. Julia Clones' study in the work plan for the PEP design team
- ♦ Wherever possible, including specific gender dimensions within the scopes of work for the PEP project(s), particularly for public awareness activities, surveys, and policy assessments and reviews
- ♦ Formalizing and funding gender sensitivity within the PEP, by inclusion of a position for a staff gender specialist with program-wide responsibility (or at least making this an explicit responsibility of a staff member)
- ♦ Making the Clones report and this further evaluation part of the background material for key contractor personnel
- ♦ Providing gender sensitivity training to all contractor personnel on a regular basis
- ♦ Requiring the inclusion of language and benchmarks in project work plans that addresses gender issues, including gender sensitivity training for GOE partner organizations
- ♦ Requiring that contractors include accountability for gender issues in staff performance reviews.

¹³ USAID–Egypt Mission web site, <http://www.usaid-eg.org>